

## **Selected Discourses Relating to Non-Muslims: A Review of Madkhali's Refutation of Sayyid Qutb**

Nafiu Ahmad Arikewuyo  
Department of Islamic Studies.  
Al-Hikmah University. Ilorin, Nigeria.  
abuamina20@gmail.com

<https://doi.org/10.22452/usuluddin.vol52no1.7>

### **Abstract**

The attitude of Islam towards non-Muslims has been a subject of attention for contemporary Muslim scholars as well as the non-Muslim researchers. While the Muslim scholars are interested in presenting the just system adopted by Islam for non-Muslims, some Western scholars are keen on identifying the loopholes inherent in the Islamic system. Of the modern scholars who have contributed to the discourse, with much influence on the contemporary Muslim scholarship, are Sayyid Qutb and Rabi'u Madkhali. The former enjoys much patronage of the Islamists, while the latter is a diehard salafi jurist reputable for his pathological hatred and refutations for the Islamists and modernists. Against this background, this study reviews Madkhali's refutations of Qutb over selected issues concerning the non-Muslims living under the Muslim rule. The study observes from the three issues discussed in this paper that Madkhali is under the influence of past black pages of the Muslim history when hostility and enmity were the order of the day, while Qutb represents more of the view of modern jurists, who need to face the challenges of modern state. The study recommends further investigation into Madkhali's other refutations of Sayyid Qutb.

**Keywords:** Madkhali; Sayyid Qutb; review; Islam and non-Muslims

### **Introduction**

The works and thoughts of Sayyid Qutb (1906-1966) have largely influenced the awakening of Muslims in the contemporary world. The summary of his thoughts is the total condemnation of the Western-dominated system and agitation for the Islamization of the current system. He used the weapon of high-powered literary skills and religious zeal, which characterized his works to appeal to a very large number of Muslim youths and Islamists. The new concepts promoted by his works include *jahiliyyah* (referring to the current system as a pre-Islamic replica), *hakimiyah* (referring to the supremacy of the Islamic system), *thawrah* (referring to revolution

as a means of changing the current system), *takfir* (referring to the contemporary society as un-Islamic). All the aforementioned terms have constituted the orbit around which the advocacy of the modern violent jihadists and insurgents in Arabia revolves. Hence, the thoughts and works of Qutb have received special attention from the constituted authorities, who are the victims of his thoughts as well as the Western researchers who are committed to establishing the link between the thoughts of Qutb and the various blocs of militant jihadists. It is worthy of note that Muslim scholars, either from among Qutb's adherents who are willing to spare him of the implications of his thoughts on the global world or those who seem to defend the Islamic theology against the militants who address Qutb as their ideologue, are not left out in the literature surrounding the discourse about the thoughts of Qutb.

The post-Arab Spring has featured the circulation of Rabi'u Madkhali's refutation books on Qutb. Madkhali is a diehard salafi cleric with much influence in the Islamic University of Madinah where he retired as a Professor of Hadith. He had been known as an unrepentant supporter of the Saudi's establishment and monarchy during and after the religious polemics surrounding the Gulf War at the beginning of the 90s).<sup>1</sup> His works which aim to destroy the arguments of Qutb's theories and concepts have negatively influenced the hostile position of modern salafi adherents towards the works, thoughts, adherents and admirers of Sayyid Qutb.<sup>2</sup> Sayyid Qutb's works were considered the spring for political orientation, opposition and check in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia where Madkhali resides as one of the leading and elderly scholars. Hence, Madkhali launched an academic attack on those works and came out to publicize what he described as fundamental heresies contained in the works. Among the heresies alleged by Madkhali against Qutb are abusing the companions, calling for uniformity of religion, revolutionary approach, etc.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Rabi' bin Hadi Madkhali, *Sadd Udwan al-Mulhidin* (Riyadh: Dar at-Turath, 1992), 12.

<sup>2</sup> Nafiu Ahmad Arikewuyo, *A Comparative Study of Revivalist Da'wah Approach of Salafiyah and Muslim Brotherhood-Oriented Groups in Yorubaland* (Kwara: Ph.D. Thesis: Department of Religions, History and Heritage Studies, Kwara State University, Malete, Nigeria, 2019).

<sup>3</sup> Madkhali, *Al-'Awasim mimma fi kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim* (Ujman: Maktabatu'l Furqan, 2001), 23.

Before the publication of his submissions on Qutb's works, Madkhali sought the consent and review of another high-ranked scholar of the Kingdom, Bakru Abu Zaydi. The latter after reading the manuscript replied in a written letter that the work did not worth being published and accused Madkhali of twisting the views of Qutb in all the alleged heresies.<sup>4</sup> According to his words “I read your work and found it devoid of fundamentals of academic work, objectivity, accurate quotation, acceptance of truth and ethics of academic conversations”<sup>5</sup> Abu Zayd furthered that Qutb was a great scholar who died for the cause of Islam and that even if he had committed a religious mistake, the unethical approach adopted by Madkhali did not suit him. The manuscript, however, was published with the commendation of another salafi scholar in the person of Nasirudeen al-Albani (d. 1999).

Against this background, the present article attempts to critique some submissions made by Madkhali in his work, titled “*al-Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim*” (The Safety from the Blunders Contained in the Works of Sayyid Qutb). The purpose for choosing this book is prompted by its popularity as a refutation work against Qutb, coupled with the fact that it enjoins much acceptance among the adherents of modern Salafism. The author also commands a considerable respect and loyalty among a large number of contemporary students of Islamic studies, most especially in Arabia. Because of the limitation of articles such as the present one, three issues which are related to the attitude of Islam to non-Muslims were selected for study. Although Madkhali's work contains refutation of Qutb over different issues, the writer decides to focus on non-Muslims because it occupies a central point of condemnation and accusation against Sayyid Qutb. In fact, at some points Madkhali accuses Qutb of accepting uniformity of religion, due to the latter's alleged lenient positions on non-Muslims.

---

<sup>4</sup> Nafiu Ahmad Arikewuyo, “Politicization of Religion and Religionization of Politics: The Madkalyiah and Sururiyyah Narratives as Case Study,” *Jurnal Usuluddin* 50(2) (2022), 113-122.

<sup>5</sup> Nafiu Ahmad Arikewuyo, *A Comparative Study of Revivalist Da'wah Approach of Salafiyah and Muslim Brotherhood-Oriented Groups in Yorubaland*, 389.

Previous works on Qutb are largely focused on appreciating his modern style of interpreting the Glorious Qur'an, as epitomized in his "*Fi Zilal al-Qur'an*" (Under the Shades of the Qur'an). Yusuf submits that, the focus of Qutb in *Fi Zilal al-Qur'an* revolves around two major themes, namely: *al-hakimiyyah* or sovereignty, and *da'wah*.<sup>6</sup> Asyraf et al. conclude that, the content of *Zilal* that revolve around Qutb's treatment of the social and political problems facing Egyptian society and the Muslim *ummah* based on the Qur'an attracted both Muslim and Western scholars attentions to consider his view and his influence upon the new Muslim generation in particular on the socio religious concern and commitment towards their religion and nation (*ummah*) as a whole.<sup>7</sup> Also, Asyraf and Nooraihan have postulated how Qutb used his new style of *tafsir* as an alternative solution for the contemporary economic and social quagmires.<sup>8</sup> In the same direction, Nooraihan et al. have described Qutb in *Fi Zilal al-Qur'an* as a social critic.<sup>9</sup>

However, the work of Sayyid Qutb that has attracted more attention is his *Ma'alim fi at-Tariq* (Milestone). The work has assumed universal reference for the friends and foes of the author. Steven has considered Milestone as the solid foundation for the Arab Spring which took off in 2010.<sup>10</sup> Ilman and Septi have also accused Qutb of being the source of Islamic fundamentalism in the contemporary world.<sup>11</sup> James has also labeled Qutb as a radical

---

<sup>6</sup> Badmas 'Lanre Yusuf, *Sayyid Qutb: A Study of His Tafsir* (Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 2009), 56.

<sup>7</sup> Asyraf, Rahman, Wan, Ibrahim and Nooraihan, Ali, "Fi Zilal al-Qur'an: Sayyid Qutb's Contemporary Commentary on the Qur'an", *International Journal of Business and Social Sciences* 2 (12) (2001), 281-288.

<sup>8</sup> Asyraf, Rahman & Nooraihan, Ali, "The Influence of Al-Mawdudi and The Jama'at Al Islami Movement on Sayyid Qutb Writings", *World Journal of Islamic History and Civilization* 2(4) (2012), 232-236.

<sup>9</sup> Nooraihan, Ali Asyraf, Rahman, Wan Ibrahim and Mohd Yousuf, "From Religious Realism to Social Criticism: Sayyid Qutb's Approach in Fi Zilal al Qur'an", *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 1(3) (2012), 258-263.

<sup>10</sup> Zenikesh Steven, Sayyid Qutb's "Milestones and Its Impact on the Arab Spring", *Small Wars Journals*, (2013), 11.

<sup>11</sup> Ilman, Nafi' & Septi, Gumiandari, "The Root of Islamic Fundamentalism in The Political Thoughts Of Al-Mawdudi and Sayyid Qutb: A Historical Study", *Al-Tamaddun* 7(2) (2019), 258-277.

intellectual.<sup>12</sup> Another Western scholar who has a negative view of Milestone is Thameem who asserts that Re-reading Milestones and other writings, it is clear that Qutb articulated a bold, unapologetic conception of Islam that denies the authority of “foreign life conceptions,” claims for Islam universal validity and decries the economic injustices which the masses have to endure.<sup>13</sup> Qutb argued that the dominant socio-political system of the contemporary Islamic and non-Islamic world is that of *jahiliyyah* – a condition of sinfulness, injustice, suffering and ignorance of Islam’s divine guidance. All societies that do not follow the rule of Allah SWT are in a state of *jahiliyyah*.<sup>14</sup>

It is worth mentioning that aside from the aforementioned scholars who have berated the thoughts promoted by Qutb in Milestone, there are other scholars from among his group-Muslim Brotherhood- who are also critics of his revolutionary approach. In the Second Guide of the Ikhwan, Hasan Hidaybi condemns the attempt of labeling the contemporary Muslim community as un-Islamic.<sup>15</sup> In the same vein, Qaradawi asserted that Qutb does not have supporters from among the senior adherents of the Muslim Brotherhood over his revolutionary method.<sup>16</sup> However, some scholars have come to the defense of Qutb against the previous accusation made by his friends and foes alike. Bahansawi spares Qutb of the guilt of radicalization of Muslim youths and puts the onus on Muhammad Qutb-junior brother of Sayyid- who, according to him, was responsible for preaching radical thoughts after the death of the senior Qutb.<sup>17</sup> Interestingly, Muhammad Qutb is one of the teachers and mentors of Osama bin Laden through ‘Abdullah bin ‘Azzam, another mentee of junior Qutb. ‘Ubayd also maintains that the blank labeling of the Muslim community as an un-Islamic

---

<sup>12</sup> Toth James, *Sayyid Qutb: The Life and Legacy of a Radical Islamic Intellectual* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 16.

<sup>13</sup> Thameem, Ushamah, “Extremism in the Discourse of Sayyid Qutb: Myth and Reality”, *Intellectual Discourse* 50(2) (2007), 167-198.

<sup>14</sup> Thameem, “Extremism in the Discourse of Sayyid Qutb”.

<sup>15</sup> Hasan Hidaybi, *Du’atun La Qudatun* (Cairo: Hadyu Muhammadi, 1972), 3.

<sup>16</sup> Yusuf Qaradawi, *Al-Ijtihad al-Mu’asir bayna al-Indibat Wa al-Infirah* (Cairo: Dar at- Tawzi’ Wah-Nashri, 2007), 94.

<sup>17</sup> Salim Bahansawi, *Shubuhah Hawla al-Fikr al-Islami* (Cairo: Daru al-Wafa, 1998), 78.

society by Qutb is not intentional, and it is only aimed to awaken the Muslim community from the slumber of adopting the un-Islamic system.<sup>18</sup>

Comparing Qutb's thoughts with others and tracing his ideologies to the likes of Mawdudi and al-Banna, the founder of the Muslim Brotherhood are another field of research that has been filled up by previous researchers. Soage traces Qutb's theories of *hakimiyyah* and *jahiliyyah* to the Pakistani scholar, Mawdudi.<sup>19</sup> In the same vein, Asyraf and Nooraihan established the influence of Mawdudi in the Qutb's writings. According to them, Qutb is an intellectual product of Mawdudi's thoughts.<sup>20</sup> While making a comparison between al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb, Tommy submits that, Hassan al-Banna laid the foundation for the idea of an Islamic order through socio-moral reform and activism, Qutb intellectualized Islamism and developed the concept further, deeming everyone not following his specific view of Islam as enemies—belonging in the realm of *jahiliyyah*.<sup>21</sup> Tommy's submission has been corroborated by Soage.<sup>22</sup>

It is given the foregoing literature review that one can identify a leap in the attention given to the refutations of Madkhali by previous researchers. One major factor that may be responsible for this manifestation is that Madkhali's refutation of Qutb is written in the Arabic language with a conservative style and narrow-minded approach of modern salafism, which may not likely attract the partial attention of an objective researcher. Be it as it may, the current attempt is willing to fill the gap. The article is segmented into an introduction, a brief background about Sayyid Qutb and

---

<sup>18</sup> Ibrahim Ubayd, *Adwau ala Shiar al-Islam Huwa al-Hillu* (Alexandria: Darul Ibd, 2006), 24.

<sup>19</sup> Soage Ana Belen, "Islamism and Modernity: The Political Thought of Sayyid Qutb", *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions* 10(2) (2010), 189–203.

<sup>20</sup> Asyraf, Rahman & Nooraihan, Ali, "The Influence of Al-Mawdudi and The Jama'at Al Islami Movement on Sayyid Qutb Writings", *World Journal of Islamic History and Civilization* 2(4) (2012), 232-236.

<sup>21</sup> Tommy, Larsson, *Hassan al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb: A Comparative Analysis*. (Master's Thesis: History Department of Archaeology, Conservation and History, Faculty of Humanities, University of Oslo, 2019).

<sup>22</sup> Soage, Ana Belen, "Hasan al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb: Continuity or Rupture?" *The Muslim World* 22(2) (2009), 45-49.

Rabi'u Madkhali, an overview of Madkhali's *al-'Awasim*, legislation in a Muslim state, abolition of slavery, and a conclusion.

### **Brief Account about Sayyid Qutb**

Sayyid Qutb bin Ibrahim bin Husayn al-Shadhili was born in 1906 in Moshe village in the Asyut district.<sup>23</sup> As characteristic of Egyptian parents, his father, Ibrahim, not only gave him sound home training but also encouraged him to devote his time to the Qur'an, which he was able to memorize at the age of eleven before he went to public school. Sayyid joined the famous Egyptian Centre for Arabic and Islamic Studies, Dar al-Ulum; and having acquired basic knowledge he proceeded further and registered in the tertiary section of Dar al-Ulum for specialized studies in Arabic Language and Literature. At the age of 27, he graduated in 1933 and obtained a Bachelor of Arts degree with a Graduate Certificate in Education.<sup>24</sup>

Shortly after his graduation, he worked briefly with the famous Egyptian newspaper, al-Ahram. He also freelanced for two magazines, namely: al-Risalah and ath-Thaqafah. He later joined the services of the Egyptian Ministry of Education Headquarters. Throughout this period, Sayyid's Islamic direction was hardly noticed, it was through his book entitled *Social Justice in Islam* that people began to take note of his devotion to the promotion of Islamic ideology. In 1948, Sayyid was among the youths who were sent to the United States to undergo a close study of the modern educational system of that country.<sup>25</sup>

In 1949, his second year in the United States, he was chopping in a store when he saw both white men and women jubilating over the news of the death of Hasan al-Banna, the founder of the Muslim Brotherhood. From that incident, he developed a passion for searching the activities and missions of the Muslim Brotherhood. Thus, when Sayyid returned to Egypt in 1952, he disappointed his sponsors by criticizing the very system that he was asked to go and understudy. He went further to criticize Egyptian educational administrators whom he accused of being over-Americanized.<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>23</sup> Yusuf, *Sayyid Qutb: A Study of His Tafsir*, 69.

<sup>24</sup> Ashmawi Sulayman, *Al-Alim al-Rabbani al-Shahid Sayyid Qutb* (n.p., 1969).

<sup>25</sup> Yusuf, *Sayyid Qutb*, 61.

<sup>26</sup> Yusuf, *Sayyid Qutb*, 62.

He requested his retirement from public service in 1953 at the age of 47 years to be fully committed to the *da'wah* activities under the shade of the Muslim Brotherhood. As a member of the Muslim Brotherhood, Sayyid Qutb assumed the role of theorist and ideologue as well as a source of inspiration for the largest number of the group's members.<sup>27</sup> His write-ups became the reference point for all Islamists across the globe. His activism along with other senior members of the group subjected them to incarceration in 1954 and 1965 respectively. Most of his works that are replete with excessive zeal for change in the governance system and labeling the current order of the day across Muslim nations were penned down in prison.

In 1965 when the Egyptian President, Gamal Nasser was on an official visit to the Union of the Soviet Socialist Republic (USSR), he announced in Moscow that his government had uncovered a plan by the Muslim Brotherhood to stage a coup and cause a chaotic situation in Egypt and Sayyid was to lead the coup. Hence, after their arraignment, Sayyid and some prominent members of the group were sentenced to death by hanging on Sunday, 22 August 1966.<sup>28</sup>

### **Brief Account about Rabi'u Madkhali**

Rabi'u bin Hadi bin 'Umayr al-Madkhali was born in 1351 A.H. to the famous clan of Madakhilah located in the Southern part of Saudi. He lost his father at the tender age of one and a half, thus, was raised by his mother who took care of his educational and spiritual growth. Madkhali attended the local religious schools of his village where he received elementary aspects of the Qur'an, hadith, morphology, syntax, rhetoric, and prophetic biography.<sup>29</sup>

His formal education began with the Educational Institute of Samitah where he graduated before enrolling into the Shari'ah College of Riyadh. He could not stay long as the reputable Islamic University of Madinah was created in 1963. Thus, Madkhali was among the pioneer students of the new University. He was opportune to receive training as a student from prominent religious

---

<sup>27</sup> Qaradawi, *Al-Ikhwān al-Muslimūn* (Cairo: Maktabat Wahbah, 1999), 89.

<sup>28</sup> Yusuf, *Sayyid Qutb*, 76.

<sup>29</sup> Arikewuyo, *A Comparative Study of Revivalist Da'wah Approach of Salafiyyah and Muslim Brotherhood-Oriented Groups in Yorubaland*, 98.

authorities such as Abdul-Azeez bin Baz, Muhammad al-Amin Ash-Shinqiti and Muhammad Nasirudeen al-Albani. Madkhali later did his Master's and doctoral degrees at the King Abdul-Azeez University, Makkan branch with a specialization in hadith.

He returned to the Islamic University of Madinah as a lecturer and later as the Head of the Department of Sunnah where he was privileged to teach and supervise a large number of Postgraduate students of hadith and sunnah. Madkhali, as a lecturer at the University, along with other scholars such as Muhammad Aman al-Jami, Ubayd al-Jabiri, and Suhaymi, have greatly influenced the products of the University in terms of ideological and methodological position in religious discourses. Their students are distinguishable from other blocs of Saudi's salafism with utter obedience to the establishment, ultra-conservative positions, hatred for scholars and clerics outside their orientation, and extraordinary commitment to the refutation of Muslim organizations and movements, most especially the Muslim Brotherhood.

Madkhali had been an influential scholar with much concentration in Madinah before the 90s. However, his fame beyond the Madinah was attributed to his role during the polemics surrounding the event of the Gulf War at the beginning of the 90s. He spearheaded the traditional scholars who supported the position of the Monarch and declared the *Sahwah* progressives who condemned the government position as a political threat to the interest of the dynastic rule in the Kingdom.<sup>30</sup> Since Sayyid Qutb's works were considered the spring for the political orientation of the new *Sahwah*, Rabi'u al-Madkhali launched an academic attack on those works and came out to publicize what he described as fundamental heresies contained in the works. Hence, he is credited with the highest number of refutations works against Sayyid Qutb. Some of his works against Sayyid Qutb include *Adwa'u Islamiyyah 'Ala 'Aqidat Sayyid Qutb Wa fikrihi* (Shed light on the doctrines and thought of Sayyid Qutb), *Mata'in Sayyid Qutb fi Ashab Rasulullah* (Sayyid Qutb's Discreditation of the Prophet's Companion) and *al-'Awasim mimma fi kutub Sayyid mina'l*

---

<sup>30</sup> Arikewuyo, Nafiu Ahmad, "Politicization of Religion and Religionization of Politics: The Madkhaliyah and Sururiyah Narratives as a Case Study" *Jurnal Usuluddin* 50(2) (2022), 113-122.

Qawasim (The Safety from the Blunders Contained in the Works of Sayyid Qutb).

### **An Overview of al-‘Awasim mimma fi kutub Sayyid mina’l Qawasim**

The work, which is 167 pages, contains two chapters, with the first chapter focusing on Sayyid Qutb’s thoughts on legislation (*Tashri’*). The first chapter is classified into eight sections. The second chapter focuses on Qutb’s blackmailing of Muslim clerics and scholars with twelve sections under it.

The work’s first page contains the comment of an admirable mentor of the author, in the person of Muhammad Nasirudeen al-Albani (d. 1999), which reads thus, “All your refutation against Sayyid Qutb is accurate. It is crystal clear to the audience who is partially conscious of the basics of Islam that Sayyid is a first-class ignoramus about the fundamentals and non-fundamentals of Islam. May Allah reward you my dear brother, Rabi’u for discharging the responsibility of exposing the ignorance and deviation of Sayyid Qutb”.<sup>31</sup> This comment, no doubt, is used by the author to further justify his attack on Sayyid Qutb.

The author's introduction is replete with labeling, emotion, and accusation, which propels one to conclude that the work is not done with academic spirit. The preamble is opened, after the quotation of prophetic traditions regarding being truthful, with labeling those promoting Qutb as betrayers. There is a strong probability that the author is referring here to Bakru Abu Zayd (d. 2008), another senior Salafi scholar in Saudi, who disapproved of the publication of the refutation work, on the basis that Madkhali has been beclouded by emotional submissions of other than academic assessment. The author quotes from Ibn Taymiyah (d. 1328) who regards the refutation against the arrowhead of heretic sects as a great Jihad in Islam. He concludes, even from his preamble, that Sayyid Qutb, being a sheer heretic in the status of the notorious Khawarij, Jahmiyah, and Shi’ah, deserves more than the attack he launches on him.<sup>32</sup> That the author’s conclusion has been known before reading his refutation is sufficient to rule out his work as an academic work.

---

<sup>31</sup> Madkhali, *Al-‘Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina’l Qawasim* (Ujman: Maktabatu’l Furqan, 2001), 2.

<sup>32</sup> Madkhali, *Al-‘Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina’l Qawasim*, 6.

The following sections are characterized by the title of the mistake committed by Sayyid Qutb based on the interpretation of the author, and then following it up with refutation. Some of the mistakes titled by the author include the adoption of socialism and the abolition of slavery, Islam being a mixture of Christianity and Communism, the thought of the internationality of Islam, giving license to other religions under the Islamic government, freedom of faith, worship should not be taken as life preoccupation, making jest of Muslim clerics and labeling Muslim scholars as religious entrepreneurs, etc. While the author may be right in his interpretation of Qutb's texts in some areas, he is not free of bias in some aspects.

The author is accurate in describing some statements made by Qutb as mocking the Muslim scholars. For instance, Qutb has adopted two words, namely 'men of religion' and 'dervish' for Muslim scholars, a style which is known with the socialists. He has also declared that the jobless men of God in the Muslim community shall-when the Islamic state becomes a reality-be dedicated to a more productive business other than the seclusion in the place of worship. He also allayed the fear of some people perceiving Islamic rule as a system where the clerics and dervish take over the governance by stating that such a perception is flawed and has no historical antecedent, coupled with the fact that even the outfit worn by some Muslim clerics-that makes them special- is not a dictate of Islam. Sayyid Qutb further claims a disconnection between Islam as a faith and its clerics. He submits that no one is farther than Islam as the so-called Muslim scholars who deceitfully appear as representatives of the faith. These and other statements provoked Madkhali to conclude that Sayyid Qutb is a mockery of religious authorities who are very key stakeholders in the Islamic state being agitated for by Qutb.

It is worth stating that the statements of Qutb could not be disconnected from the context and circumstances under which he made them. Generally, during his time the so-called Muslim clerics were lifeless and non-effective because of the colonial legacy being in operation in Egypt. Muslim scholars generally and Azhar University, which was the mainstay of Islamic scholarship, according to Yusuf and Qaradawi have become a tune in the hands of its piper. The resurgence of the Muslim *Ummah* could not be

placed in the hand of such a directionless set of people.<sup>33</sup> That someone in the age of Hasan al-Banna in 1928 could conceive the missions he set for himself is a testimony that Muslim clerics in Egypt where Sayyid Qutb made the aforementioned statements were helpless. Hence, the target of Qutb's statements is the handicapped Muslim scholars in his community, and not a mockery of Muslim authorities across the ages, as interpreted by Madkhali.

The areas where Madkhali has misinterpreted the statement of Sayyid Qutb abound. For instance, when Sayyid Qutb states the following: "Islam should rule (the world) because it is the only faith that contains the positive features and missions of Christianity and Communism, and it also supersedes the duo with balancedness, moderation, and synergy." Madkhali alleges that the content is very proximate to the thought of *wahdat al-wujud* (pantheism) which entails the uniformity of all faiths.<sup>34</sup> The context under which Sayyid Qutb speaks justifies his submission, as asserting the positive sides of Christianity and communism does not amount to approving them as acceptable divine faiths. The Qur'an, despite condemning the trinity feature in Christendom, praises its positive side when it provides, "Strongest among men in enmity to the believers wilt Thou find the Jews and Pagans; and nearest among them in love to the believers wilt Thou find those who say, "We are Christians": because amongst these are men devoted to learning and men who have renounced the world, and They are not arrogant." (al-Ma'idah: 82).

Generally, al-'Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim is highly characterized by accusations that need unequivocal proof, misinterpretation of Qutb's statements, and emotional submissions. All the aforementioned traits have been raised even before its publication by Bakru Abu Zayd. However, Madkhali is accurate in his description of Sayyid Qutb's style of presentation as revolutionary. This allegation has been confirmed through the Qutb's statements about change in leadership and substitution of current Muslim scholars whom he described as men of religion, dervish, and religious entrepreneurs.

---

<sup>33</sup> Yusuf, *Sayyid Qutb*, 35; Qaradawi, *Al-Ikhwan al-Muslimun*, 56.

<sup>34</sup> Madkhali, *Al-'Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim*, 13.

## Freedom of Religion and Faith for Non-Muslims under the Muslim State

Sayyid Qutb discusses freedom of religion as one of the rights accorded by Islam to the non-Muslims living under its rule. He says, "... the mission of Islam is a revolution against religious nepotism when the Qur'an states that no compulsion in faith and that if Allah had willed, all humans would have professed uniform faith."<sup>35</sup> In another work, Qutb remarks, "Islam does not guarantee freedom of faith for only its adherents. Rather it guarantees such for adherents of other faiths, with a directive that Muslims should defend this right, even if such will end in physical fighting..."<sup>36</sup>

While frowning at the aforementioned assertions, Madkhali mentions that Qutb's view is at variance with the Prophet's practice, which was the invitation of the rulers of his time to embrace Islam. More so, the Qur'an has ordered Muslim authorities to fight the non-Muslims until they embrace Islam as provided in Q2: 193.<sup>37</sup> Madkhali further concludes that Qutb's assertion in this regard, which is tailored along suiting the whims of the orientalist and Western liberalists, will inevitably perpetuate the existence of infidelity and polytheism in the Muslim community.<sup>38</sup>

The Prophetic practice of writing to the rulers of his time to embrace Islam was a peaceful offer and propagation of Islam for neighbouring brothers who were not even under the Muslim rule. This piece of evidence cannot be used to defeat the intent of the provision of Q2: 256 which unequivocally states, "no compulsion in faith". Ibn Kathir comments on the above verse thus, "the verse entails that you should not force Islam on any one because Islam is very clear and convincing; it does not need compelling any one to embrace it."<sup>39</sup> The cause of revealing the verse clears all doubt concerning its connotation. It was reported through the authority of Ibn 'Abbas that, "in the pre-Islamic era, a barren woman would vow that if she later gave birth would impose the Jewish faith on her child. During the relocation of Banu Nadhir, some fathers of the

---

<sup>35</sup> Sayyid Qutb, *Dirasat Islamiyyah* (Cairo: Dar Sharuq, 2008), 34-35.

<sup>36</sup> Qutb, *Nahwa Mujtami' in Islamiyyin* (Cairo: Dar Sharuq, 2008), 106.

<sup>37</sup> Madkhali, *Al-'Awasiim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim*, 96.

<sup>38</sup> Madkhali, *Al-'Awasiim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim*, 98.

<sup>39</sup> Isma'il Ibn Kathir, *Tafsir Ibn Kathir* (Beirut: Darul Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1999), vol.1, 134.

Ansar extraction said they would not allow their children become jew and Allah revealed this verse supporting their action of not imposing jewish faith on others.”<sup>40</sup>

There is no allusion pointing to the freedom of religion for non-Muslims as a sacred principle more than the provisions regarding the protection of churches and synagogues in Islam. The Qur’an prohibits anyone from destroying churches, monasteries and synagogues when it provides, “Permission is given to those who fight because they have been oppressed....For had it not been for God’s repelling some men by means of others, (all) monasteries, churches, synagogues, and mosques, wherein the name of God is often mentioned, would certainly have been destroyed.” Q22: 39-40. Based on this verse, great scholars such as Ibn Hazm hold that Muslims are even required to fight if necessary, to defend these non-Muslim places of worship from being destroyed.”<sup>41</sup> The continued existence of numerous monasteries, sacred grounds and places of worship belonging to Christians, Jews Zoroastrians, Hindus, Buddhists, etc., in places that have once been or still are completely under Muslim rule shows the respect that Islam has for the rights of others to their respective faiths and places of worships.<sup>42</sup>

This spirit can be seen in display in the letter of the first Caliph, Abu-Bakr to the non-Muslims of Najran, wherein he guaranteed for them the protection of their synagogues, monks and monasteries.<sup>43</sup> In a similar vein, the treaty of the second Caliph, Umar ibn al-Khattab, with the people of Iliya of Jerusalem reinforces this fact. In the treaty he guaranteed the security of churches from occupation and demolition.<sup>44</sup> The respect Islam enjoins on Muslims towards non-Muslims with regard to protecting their places of worship have been testified to by non-Muslim critic of Islam, such as Patriarch Ghaytho who admits that the Muslim community treat their priests and saints with dignity and offer aid to churches and monasteries.<sup>45</sup>

---

<sup>40</sup> Isma’il Ibn Kathir, *Tafsir Ibn Kathir*, vol.1, 147.

<sup>41</sup> Da’wah Institute of Nigeria, *Protection of Churches, Mosques, and Synagogues in Islam* (Minna: Islamic Education Trust, 2012), 6.

<sup>42</sup> Hoffman Murad, *Protection of Religious Minorities in Islam* (Leicester: The Islamic Foundation, 1998), 24.

<sup>43</sup> Abu Yusuf, *Kitab al-Kharaj* (Cairo: Darul Furqan, 2006), 34.

<sup>44</sup> Abu Yusuf, *Kitab al-Kharaj*, 52.

<sup>45</sup> Da’wah Institute of Nigeria, *Muslim Relations with Christians, Jews and Others* (Minna: Islamic Education Trust, 2018), 119.

The Q2: 196 used by Madkhali as an evidence for fighting non-Muslims based on religious differences, coupled with a corresponding hadith that narrates the Prophet saying that he is under the command to fight all non-Muslims until they embrace Islam, has been debunked by Shibrini who argues that the provision of the two texts is general, and its specification has been identified as hostile and aggressive non-Muslims.<sup>46</sup> Some of the texts that have specified the generality recorded in the verse include Q2: 190 which provides, “Fight in the course of Allah those who fight you and don’t transgress, for Allah does not love the transgressors.” It is worthy of note that Madkhali is only echoing what a large number of classical orthodox scholars who lived in an hostile circumstance have propagated in their works. Such notion is not feasible to operate in a globalized world of the modern time. More so, his submission is only applicable to an Islamic state, which is non-existent in the contemporary globe. Qutb has successfully set out a theory that is suitable to the multi-religious society, which is a core feature of the modern world.

That such view as held by Qutb will inevitably perpetuate the florescence of infidelity in the Muslim community, according to Madkhali, cannot hold water considering the conditions attached to the freedom of faith guaranteed for the non-Muslims under the Muslim state. Qaradawi states that the freedom of religion of non-Muslims must be regulated by them giving respect to the faith of their host. They should not attempt to erect churches in towns populated by only Muslims, such that doing so will look like a threat to the interest of the Islamic community.<sup>47</sup>

### **Equal Rights with Muslims**

Sayyid Qutb declares that Islam remains the only system that accommodates adherents of other beliefs with the required freedom and accords them equal right given to Muslim citizens.<sup>48</sup> Madkhali counters his submission with the following arguments: Q68: 35-36, Q32: 18, Q45: 21 which negate equalizing Muslims with the

---

<sup>46</sup> Muhammad Shirbini, *Al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah* (Cairo: Maktabat al-Iman, 2017), 12-15.

<sup>47</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama'i al-Islamiy* (Cairo: Maktabat Wahbah, 1998), 20.

<sup>48</sup> Qutb, *Dirasat*, 80-81.

disbelievers. He also relies on a hadith that says, “A Muslim would not be killed if he kills a non-Muslim”<sup>49</sup> Madkhali also refers to the Umar covenant with the Syrian Christians wherein the Muslim leader ordered that they must not publicly display the symbols of their faith, they must not put on the outfit similar to that of the Muslims, and they must not bury their corpse in the cemetery of the Muslims.<sup>50</sup>

The verses mentioned by Madkhali explicitly assert the difference between the believers and non-believers in term of their moral disposition and faith. This fact, which cannot be disputed, does not negate that non-Muslims are accorded equal rights with Muslims in selected socio-economic aspects. The verses only establish the true identity of the Muslims and others. Q68: 35 has been explained by Ibn Kathir as do we equalize the heavenly reward of the believers with the non-Muslims?”<sup>51</sup> Some socio-economic aspects where non-Muslims enjoy equal rights with Muslims include right of protecting their lives, property, faith and conviction, appointment into government offices, etc.<sup>52</sup> During the Abbasid era; some Christians assumed the position of ministers under the Islamic rule, likewise in the Umayyad dynasty.<sup>53</sup>

For the hadith that provides Muslims should not be killed in lieu of killing a non-Muslim, there is a heated debate among Muslim jurists over its proper interpretation and connotation. While Shafi'i and Ahmad accept the literal meaning of the tradition, Abu Hanifah contextualizes the meaning of non-Muslim mentioned in the hadith as a warring one.<sup>54</sup> Abu Hanifah's view has been adopted by many modern jurists such as Abu Zahrah, Zidan and Qaradawi.<sup>55</sup> The Qur'an never distinguishes between souls as contained in Q17: 70.

The 'Umar Covenant with the Syrian Christians has been used by Madkhali as a fixed religious authority as did many classical

---

<sup>49</sup> Muhammad bin 'Isma'il Bukhari, *Sahih al-Bukhari* (Cairo: Dar Ibn Hazm, 2008), no.6915.

<sup>50</sup> Madkhali, *Al-'Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim*, 51-52.

<sup>51</sup> Ibn Kathir, *Tafsir Ibn Kathir*, vol.4.198.

<sup>52</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama'i al-Islamiy*, 9-26.

<sup>53</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama'i al-Islamiy*, 23.

<sup>54</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama'i al-Islamiy*, 12.

<sup>55</sup> Nafiu Arikewuyo, “Challenges of Muslim-Christian Co-Existence in a Multi-Religious Nation: The Role of Muslim Orthodoxal Jurisprudence” *Journals of Islam in Nigeria* 2(1) (2016), 180.

orthodox scholars. Qaradawi asserts that the covenant was a mere state policy prompted by the peculiarity of the time it was formulated. Such a policy, which often changes from time, place and regime, should not be taken as an unchangeable religious text.<sup>56</sup>

### **Imposing Taxes on Non-Muslims**

Qutb makes a submission that the minority non-Muslims are obliged to pay the head tax in lieu of the security and protection given to them by the Muslim state. He resembles the tax to the Zakah being collected from the wealthy Muslims.<sup>57</sup> While opposing the above submission, Madkhali asserts that Qutb goofed when he thought that the tax being collected from the non-Muslims is in their honor, whereas the Q9: 29 has labeled it an obligation borne out of humiliation.

There is no doubt that Madkhali represents, with his submission here, the classical scholars of *tafsir* and jurisprudence. Classical works are replete with insinuations that part of the forms with which Islam has humiliated the non-Muslim identity is imposing on their male folk a statutory tax.<sup>58</sup> However, some modern jurists have maintained that there is no element of humiliation (Saghar) in the payment of tax by the non-Muslims, as the payment is made to show their submission and loyalty for the constituted authority of their host nations.<sup>59</sup> Muslims are obliged to join the military service if required by the government, while non-Muslims are spared of this responsibility. As a citizen everyone should have ways of contributing to the national security of the nation; Muslims inclusive. Hence, the head tax is a way of contributing to the national security by non-Muslims.<sup>60</sup>

### **Conclusion**

From the foregoing discussion, it can be deduced that al-‘Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina’l Qawasim is highly characterized by accusations that need unequivocal proofs, misinterpretation of

---

<sup>56</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama’i al-Islamiy*, 60.

<sup>57</sup> Madkhali, *Al-‘Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina’l Qawasim*, 86.

<sup>58</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama’i al-Islamiy*, 32.

<sup>59</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama’i al-Islamiy*, 33.

<sup>60</sup> Qaradawi, *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama’i al-Islamiy*, 33.

Qutb's statements and emotional submissions. All the aforementioned traits have been raised even before its publication by Bakru Abu Zayd.

It is worthy of observation that Madkhali is under the influence of past black pages of the Muslim history when hostility and enmity are the order of the day. Religious views formulated under that circumstances may jeopardize peaceful co-existence among people living in an entire different societal set-up. It is also observable that from the submissions of Madkhali, the target is pure Islamic state which is not existent. Qutb has been influenced by the Muslim predominantly society of Egypt, which naturally should master how to co-exist with non-Muslims than the Saudi where Madkhali lives. The major point that is missing from the aforementioned submissions of the two scholars is identification and highlighting the type of society where their submissions would be implemented. I think Qutb is more realist than Madkhali. He represents more of the view of modern jurists, who need to face the challenges of modern state. Qutb has set the ground prior to the much celebrated 2016 Marrakesh Declaration on the Rights of Religious Minorities in Predominantly Muslim Majority Communities, which had among its executive summary the following: "Call upon Muslim scholars and intellectuals around the world to develop a jurisprudence of the concept of "citizenship" which is inclusive of diverse groups. Such jurisprudence shall be rooted in Islamic tradition and principles and mindful of global changes."<sup>61</sup>

From the analysis of the method used by both scholars at reaching their submissions in the foregoing discourses, it is worthy of note that while Madkhali has followed the pattern of the literalists, Qutb is much inclined to the approach of the contextualists and rationalists. The former method usually relies heavily on apparent meanings of religious texts with little consideration for their contexts and external circumstances surrounding their revelation, while the latter is built on giving prominence to the contexts and influences under which texts are revealed.

---

<sup>61</sup> Da'wah Institute of Nigeria, *Muslim Relations with Christians, Jews and Others*, 108.

The research recommends further investigation into other Madkhali's refutation of Sayyid Qutb. Such investigation will assist to discredit other refutations made by Madkhali.

## References

- Abu Daud, Sulayman. *Sunan Abi Daud*. Beirut: Al-Maktabat al-Asriyah, 2006.
- Abu Yusuf, M. *Kitab al-Kharaj*. Cairo: Darul Furqan, 2006.
- Al-Mawardi, Abu al-Hasan. *Al-Ahkam as-Sultaniyyah*. Cairo: Darul hadith, 2005.
- Arikewuyo, Nafiu Ahmad. *A Comparative Study of Revivalist Da'wah Approach of Salafiyyah and Muslim Brotherhood-Oriented Groups in Yorubaland*. Kwara: Ph.D. Thesis: Department of Religions, History and Heritage Studies, Kwara State University, Malete, Nigeria, 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Challenges of Muslim-Christian Co-Existence in a Multi-Religious Nation: The Role of Muslim Orthodoxal Jurisprudence". *Journals of Islam in Nigeria* 2(1) (2016): 186-194.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Politicization of Religion and Religionization of Politics: The Madkhaliyah and Sururiyah Narratives as a Case Study". *Jurnal Usuluddin* 50(2) (2022): 113-122.
- Ashmawi, Sulayman. *Al-Alim ar-Rabbani ash-Shahid Sayyid Qutb*. n.p, 1969.
- Asyraf, Rahman & Nooraihan, Ali. "From Quranic Literary Studies to Socio-Religious Commitment: Sayyid Qutb's Socio-Political Orientation". *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 2(15) (2012): 34-55.
- Asyraf, Rahman & Nooraihan, Ali, "The Influence of Al-Mawdudi and The Jama'at Al Islami Movement on Sayyid Qutb Writings". *World Journal of Islamic History and Civilization* 2(4) (2012): 232-236.
- Asyraf, Rahman, Wan, Ibrahim and Nooraihan, Ali, "Fi Zilal al-Qur'an: Sayyid Qutb's Contemporary Commentary on the Qur'an". *International Journal of Business and Social Sciences* 2(12) (2011): 281-288.
- Bahansawi, Salim. *Shubuhah Hawla al-Fikr al-Islami*. Cairo: Dar al-Wafa, 1989.

- Imarah, Muhammad. *Ihyau al-Khilafat al-Islamiyyah*. Cairo: Darus Salam, 2011.
- Da'wah Institute of Nigeria. *Muslim Relations with Christians, Jews and Other*. Minna: Islamic Education Trust, 2018.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Protection of Churches, Mosques, and Synagogues in Islam*. Minna: Islamic Education Trust, 2012
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Shari'ah Intelligence*. Nigeria: Amal Printing Press, 2019.
- Dawalibi, Muhammad Ma'ruf. *Al-Dawlah wa al-Sultah fi al-Islam*. Riyadh: Dar al-Shawaf, 2002.
- Hudaybi, Hasan. *Du'atun la Qudatun*. sCairo: Hadyu Muhammadi, 1972.
- Ibn Kathir, Isma'il, *Tafsir Ibn Kathir*. Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1999.
- Ilman, Nafi' and Septi, Gumiandari. "The Root of Islamic Fundamentalism in The Political Thoughts of Al-Maududi and Sayyid Qutb: A Historical Study". *Al-Tamaddun* 7(2) (2019): 258-277.
- James, Toth. *Sayyid Qutb: The Life and Legacy of a Radical Islamic Intellectual*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- James, Toth. *Sayyid Qutb: The Life and Legacy of a Radical Islamic Intellectual*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Kamali, Muhammad Hashim. *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence*. Cambridge: The Islamic Text Society, 2003.
- Khallaf, Abdul-Wahhab. *Al-Sultat al-Thalath fi al-Islam*. Cairo: Dar Ibn al-Jawzi, 2014.
- Madkhali, Rabi' bin Hadi. *Sadd Udwan al-Mulhidin*. Riyadh: Dar at-Turath, 1992.
- Madkhali, Rabi' bin Hadi. *Al-'Awasim mimma fi Kutub Sayyid mina'l Qawasim*. Ujman: Maktabatu'l Furqan, 2011.
- Murad, Huffman. *Protection of Religious Minorities in Islam*. Leicester: The Islamic Foundation, 1998.
- Mushari, Saheed. *Al-Jamiyyah fi al-Mizan*. n.p, 2019.
- Muslim, Hajjaj. *Sahih Muslim*. Beirut: Dar Ihya' at-Turath, 2006.
- Nooraihan, Ali, Asyraf, Rahman, Wan, Ibrahim & Mohd, Yousuf. "From Religious Realism to Social Criticism: Sayyid Qutb's Approach in Fi Zilal al Qur'an". *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 1(8) (2013): 258-263.

- Qaradawi, Yusuf. *Al-Ijtihad al-Mu'asir Bayna al-Indibat wa al-Infirah*. Cairo: Dar at- Tawzi' Wah-Nashri, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Al-Ikhwah al-Muslimun*. Cairo: Maktabat Wahbah, 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Ghayr al-Muslimin fi al-Mujtama' l al-Islamiy*. Cairo: Maktabat Wahbah, 1998.
- Qutb, Sayyid. *Al- 'Adalat al-Ijtima' iyyah*. Cairo: Maktabat Wahbah, 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Dirasat Islamiyyah* Cairo: Dar Sharuq, 2008.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Fi Zilal al-Qur'an*. Cairo: Maktabat Wahbah, 1998.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *M'alim fi al-Tariq*. Turkey: Maktabat al-Ghurabai, 2019.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Nahwa Mujtama'in Islamiyyin*. Cairo: Darush Shuruq, 2008.
- Rahim, A. *Islamic History*. Lagos: Islamic Publications Bureau, 1981.
- Sabiq, Sayyid. *Fiqh al-Sunnah*. Cairo: Maktabat Dar at-Turath, n.d.
- Shirbini, Mohammad. *al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah*. Cairo: Maktabat al-Iman, 2017.
- Soage, Ana Belen. "Islamism and Modernity: The Political Thought of Sayyid Qutb". *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions* 10(2) (2010): 189-203.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Hasan al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb: Continuity or Rupture?" *The Muslim World* 22(2) (2009): 45-49.
- Steven, Zenikesh. "Sayyid Qutb's Milestones and Its Impact on the Arab Spring". *National Defense University: Small Wars Journals*, (2013): pages.
- Thameem, Ushamah. "Extremism in the Discourse of Sayyid Qutb: Myth and Reality". *Intellectual Discourse* 50(2) (2007): 167-198.
- Tommy, Larsson. "Hassan al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb: A Comparative Analysis". Master's Thesis: History Department of Archaeology, Conservation and History, Faculty of Humanities, University of Oslo, 2017.
- Ubayd, Ibrahim. *Adwau ala Shi'ar al-Islam Huwa al-Hillu*. Alexandria: Darul Ibda', 2006.
- Yusuf, Badmas 'Lanre. *Sayyid Qutb: A Study of His Tafsir*. Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 2009.